

How to Cite:

Pradhana, N. I., & Oeinada, I. G. (2021). Comparative analysis: to and ni as case particles in Japanese. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 5(1), 104-114.

<https://doi.org/10.37028/lingcure.v5n1.1029>

Comparative Analysis: To and Ni as Case Particles in Japanese

Ngurah Indra Pradhana

Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

I Gede Oeinada

Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

Abstract--This study focuses on particles To and Ni as case particles that function to express the relationship between nouns and predicates in a sentence focusing on the comparative analysis of the two case particles. Based on Tsujimura's opinion, it can be said that in Japanese, case particles are part of a phrase. Case particle is related to the function of the words in the sentence. The method used to analyze the data is Agih method (distributional method). Advanced analysis techniques with substitution techniques were applied in this study. This technique is used to study a case particle in the Japanese sentence structure. This research produces several things that are expected to be helpful to readers. To and Ni case particles can replace each other for the context of sentences that have the following meanings: Pairs Meaning, Translative Meaning, Accusative Meaning, and Ablative Meaning. But on the other hand, To and Ni as case particles can not substitution each other. Especially sentences with the following meanings: accusative meaning, commitative meaning, partner meaning, citation meaning, alatif meaning, purpose meaning, time markers meaning, diathesis on passive sentences, diathesis on causative sentences, dative meaning, and locative meaning.

Keywords---accusative meaning, alatif meaning, case particles, citation meaning, commitative meaning, Japanese sentence, partner meaning, purpose meaning, sentence structures.

Introduction

There are various classes of words in Japanese. One of the word types that are bound morpheme and does not change shape is a particle or the auxiliary word *joshi*. Etymologically, *joshi* comes from the first letter *jo*, which means 'help', and the second *shi* means 'word' is similar to the term *kotoba*, which means words,

words, or language. These two kanji characters form the meaning of ‘auxiliary words’ (Borris & Zecho, 2018).

Masuoka & Takubo (1999) classify *joshi* based on their different functions in connecting words in sentences into several groups, including case particles (*kakujoshi*) and affirmative particles (*toritate joshi*). The previous studies related to *joshi* that can be found are “the semantic roles of *kaku-joshi* in Japanese textbooks” (Sutedi, 2020; Tsuji, 2000; Zhang et al., 2006) and “analisis kesalahan penggunaan partikel *de*, *ini*, dan *o* pada kalimat pembelajar bahasa Jepang” (Sutedi, 2016; Katagiri, 2007; Uyeda, 1991). However, these studies did not compare the interchange of *kaku-joshi*.

Other studies related to *kaku-joshi* are the studies conducted by Rosliana (2013) and Ramdani et al. (2017). In this research, the writer focuses on *kakujoshi*, namely particles *to* and *ni* as case particles that function to express the relationship between nouns and predicates in a sentence focusing on the comparative analysis of the two case particles.

Theory

The case particle belongs to a class of words. However, the position of the case particles differs from the postpositions in Japanese phrases, as quoted: Incidentally, it should be noted that case particles are syntactically treated as a part of NP while Ps are considered as a lexical category that forms an independent word (Tsuji, 1997; Austin et al., 2000; Tanaka, 2000). Based on Tsujimura's opinion, it can be said that in Japanese, case particles are part of a phrase. Case particle is related to the function of the words in the sentence.

Method

In the data collection stage, the observation method was used to obtain written data. Advanced techniques followed this tapping technique in notes-taking technique and engaging-free listening techniques in subsequent practice. The note-taking process is to note things that are considered essential. In the free listening proficient listening technique, the writer only acts as an observer of language use. The data collection method was carried out by literature study, namely data collection through various written sources in Japanese (Lee, 2002; Lee, 2007).

The method used to analyze the data is the agih method (distributional method). Advanced analysis techniques with substitution techniques were applied in this study. The replacement technique (substitution) replaces some aspects of the relevant lingual unit with certain other ‘elements’ outside the appropriate linguistic unit (Sudaryanto, 1993; Zhou et al., 1996; Kita & Ide, 2007). This technique is used to study a case particle in the Japanese sentence structure.

Result

In the discussion section, two analyzes will be presented, including the possibility of substitution and the impossibility of semantically occurring substitution between the *to* and *ni* as case particles.

Substitution case particles *to* and *ni*

Some Japanese sentence structures can experience substitution between case particle *to* and particle *ni* in terms of their semantic roles. The following is an analysis of the Japanese sentence data along with the aspects that support the substitution.

- Pairs meaning (相手格/Aitekaku)

Several Japanese sentence structures have the potential to undergo substitution by replacing the case particle *to* with the case particle *ni*. These sentences can be accepted grammatically, with each having a contextual meaning.

- a) 時々大きな声で先生と話す。
Tokidoki ōkina koe de sensei **to** hanasu.
'Sometimes speak loudly **with** the teacher.'
(Botchan: 15)
- b) 時々大きな声で先生に話す。
Tokidoki ōkina koe de sensei **ni** hanasu.
'Sometimes speak loudly **to** the teacher.'

In this sentence there is the use of the case particle *to* which indicates the meaning of a pair (相手格 / Aitekaku), meaning that in the sentence there are two or more parties who carry out activities together. There is a feature in terms of structure that the case particle *to* in sentence (a) can be substituted with the case particle *ni* as in sentence (b).

Changing the case particle to be the case particle *ni* or vice versa will also cause a change in the function of the case particle. The function of the case particle *to* which initially functioned as the meaning of a pair (相手格 / Aitekaku) will change its function if it is substituted with the particle case *ni* becomes a dative case (与格 / Yokaku).

Changes in meaning will also accompany changes in the function of the case particles. The case particle *to* shows the meaning of pairing also has a derivative meaning, which means reciprocal because naturally speaking activities are carried out alternately by taking the opportunity to speak (turn-taking). Meanwhile, if it is substituted with this case particle it will change the meaning to the target meaning of verb behavior. It can also show the meaning pragmatically, namely giving a nuance of respect (尊敬語 / *sonkeigo*) to the party who is the target of verb activity which has a higher position or an older age (長幼の序 / Chōyō no jo).

- Translative meaning (変化格/Henkakaku)

In Japanese sentence structure, to indicate a change or result, the phrase *-to naru* is usually used as observed in the following sentence.

- a) その夜から萩野の家の下宿人となった。
 Sono yoru kara hagino no ie no geshukujin to natta.
 'From that night, I became a boarder at Hagino's house.'
 (Botchan: 48)

The *-to naru* pattern in sentence (a) can be substituted with the *-ni naru* pattern into the following sentence:

- b) その夜から萩野の家の下宿人になった。
 Sono yoru kara hagino no ie no geshukujin ni natta.
 'From that night I became a boarder at Hagino's house.'

The two sentences above can be accepted grammatically. The difference is that the *-to naru* pattern is more formal and is more often used in written forms, while the *-ni naru* pattern is more informal and is more often used in everyday speech. In addition, the *-to naru* pattern shows changes in the present while the *-ni naru* pattern shows changes in the future. In addition, the use of the *-to naru* pattern shows a change in conditions from the previous condition, while the *-ni naru* pattern shows the result or conclusion of a process or state.

- Accusative meaning (対格/taikaku)

To as case particle can be substituted with the case particle *ni* to express the similarity in Japanese sentences.

- a) 歓喜に似た感情。
 Kanki ni nita kanjō.
 'Feelings similar to delight.'
 (Nobi: 52)

- b) 歓喜と似た感情。
 Kanki to nita kanjō.
 'Feelings similar to delight.'

The sentence above can be accepted grammatically because they both state the comparison of two considered similar things but not the same (similar). The difference in nuances of meaning arising from using the two case particles is the case particle to describe the existence of two objects (things) that are the same. In contrast, the use of particle, in this case, illustrates the ratio of one object to another as the subject of discussion. The description of the meaning of the equation/similarity in the use of case particles *to* and particle cases *ni* in Japanese sentences can be patterned as follows:

The Pattern of Particle Case *to* : (are equally compared)

A → ← B

The Pattern of Particle Case *ni* : (B is compared to A)

A ←———— B

- Ablative meaning (奪格/Dakkaku)

The ablative meaning (奪格 / Dakkaku) is a case that marks the meaning of the motion "from" in a noun or the like.

- 藤木に部をやめてもらう。
Fujiki ni bu o yamete morau.
'Ask Fujiki to quit the club.'
(Kusa no Hana: 66)
- 藤木と部をやめてもらう。
Fujiki to bu o yamete morau.
'Have Fujiki quit the club.'

The particle case *ni* in sentence (a) shows the function of the ablative case (奪格 / Dakkaku), namely the case that marks the meaning of the motion "from" in a noun or the like. However, if the case particle *ni* in sentence (a) is substituted with the case particle *to* as in sentence (b) then the sentence function changes to the commitative case function (共同格 / Kyoudoukaku), namely the case that marks the meaning of 'accompanying, with' in the noun or the like.

Particle case *to* cannot be substituted with particle case *ni*

The function of case particles *to* and particle cases in Japanese society is very productive. This is because the *to* and *ni* case particles can describe Japanese society's culture in the language system. More interestingly, the particle case *to* or *ni* cannot be substituted semantically. Here are examples of sentences.

- Accusative meaning (対格/taikaku)
The case particle *to* cannot be substituted with the case particle *ni* to express the difference in Japanese sentences.
 - 宿と云っても普通の旅館と違う。
Yado to itte mo futsuu no ryokan to chigau.
'An inn is different from an ordinary inn.'
(Kokoro: 5)
 - 宿と云っても普通の旅館に違う。(*)
Yado to itte mo futsuu no ryokan ni chigau.
'An inn is different from an ordinary inn.'

In Japanese, to express the meaning of the difference the case particle *to* is used and it does not apply when using the case particle *ni*. This is because in stating a difference it must go through a comparison of two things together and it cannot be unilateral.

- Commitative meaning (共同格/Kyoudoukaku)

The commitative serves to mark the meaning of 'accompanying, with' a noun or the like. Here's the sentence.

a) 彼とベッドを並べて寝ていた。

Kare to beddo o narabete neteita.

'I was sleeping side by side with him.'

(Kusa no Hana: 7)

b) 彼にベッドを並べて寝ていた。(*)

Kare ni beddo o narabete neteita.

'I slept side by side with him.'

In sentence (a), the case particle *to* (と) states that the subject is doing activities together with the second party. In sentence (b), this case particle functions as a dative or object marker. Adjusted to the commitative case itself, which functions to mark the meaning of 'accompanying, with' so that in terms of Japanese sentence structure, to express the commitative case (共同格 / Kyoudoukaku) the case particle is used and vice versa does not apply to the particle case *ni* because there is no target of subject behavior.

- Partner meaning (相手格/Aitekaku)

a) 千枝子さんは汐見さんと結婚なさるのだ。

Chieko san wa Shiomi san **to** kekkonnasaru.oda.

'Chieko will marry **with** Shiomi.'

(Kusa no Hana: 196)

b) 千枝子さんは汐見さんに結婚なさるのだ。(*)

Chieko san wa Shiomi san **ni** kekkonnasaru.oda.

'Chieko gets married **to** Shiomi.'

In Japanese, the partner meaning (相手格 / Aitekaku) can only be indicated by the use of the case particle *to*. This can be seen from the case particle function *to* which states the equivalent position between subject and object in a sentence and can also be seen from the nature of the verb. The verb 結婚 / kekkon (married) indicates an action carried out by two or more people who have an equal position in a sentence and are related to one another and become one unit in building the meaning of the sentence so that the subject and object cannot be separated because they are a pair. Such activity cannot be carried out without a second party. Therefore, in terms of Japanese sentence structure, to express the meaning of pairs (相手 / Aite) the *to* as case particle is used and vice versa does not apply to the case particle *ni* because in its application the *ni* as case particle

does not function to express a joint activity but movement the one-sided or the target of a verb activity.

- Citation meaning (引用格/ Inyoukaku)

a) 家内は軽症の脳溢血と思う。

Kanai wa keishō no nōikketsu **to** omou.

'I think my wife has a mild cerebral hemorrhage.'

(Kokoro: 34)

b) 家内は軽症の脳溢血に思う。(*)

Kanai wa keishō no nōikketsu **ni** omou.

'My wife thinks of mild cerebral hemorrhage.'

c) 春日さんは手に残った葶の萼を見詰めながら、ゆっくりと言った。

Kasuga-san wa te ni nokotta sumire no gaku o mitsumenagara, yukkuri to itta.

'Kasuga said slowly, staring at the calyx left in his hand.'

(Kusa no Hana: 79)

d) 春日さんは手に残った葶の萼を見詰めながら、ゆっくりに言った。(*)

Kasuga-san wa te ni nokotta sumire no gaku o mitsumenagara, yukkuri ni itta.

'Kasuga said slowly, staring at the calyx left in his hand.'

Citation meaning in sentences (a) and (c) there is an understanding that their appearance is due to a previous phenomenon and the movement of the human mind so that actions arise. Sentences (a) and (c) are semantically different, namely sentence (a) states the content of the conjecture or estimate while sentence (c) shows a quote from the previous statement.

- Alatif meaning (方向格/ Hōkōkaku)

In Japanese, to state an alatif meaning, namely the meaning of a sentence stating "direction of purpose" can be used with this case particle while the case particle cannot be accepted grammatically in Japanese.

a) 自動車に乗った。

Jidōsha ni notta.

'I got in the car.'

(Yukiguni: 7)

b) 自動車と乗った。(*)

Jidōsha to notta.

'Riding with a car.'

Broadly speaking, the meaning of the case *ni* particle in Japanese sentences is to express an action that is done to an object that is passive, while the case particle to express an action that is carried out by an active subject and object.

Therefore, for the sentence "driving a car", where the car is a passive object, the particle case *ni* is used.

- Purpose meaning (目的格/Mokutekikaku)

a) 親類へ泊りに行っていた。
Shinrui e tomari ni itte ita.
'I was going to stay with my relatives.'
(Botchan: 94)

b) 親類へ泊りと行っていた。(*)
Shinrui e tomari to itte ita.
'I was staying with relatives.'

Looking at the verb in the sentence, the verb 行っていた / itte ita shows the movement towards the noun that comes before the particle case *ni*. So the noun in the sentence is the target of the verb that accompanies it. Therefore this case particle is used because one is the target, while the case particle *to* cannot be accepted because the sentence does not show the movement of the two subjects.

- Time markers meaning (時間格/Jikankaku)

a) 小さい時に稽古したのは確かだね。
Chisai toki ni keiko shita no wa tashikada ne.
'I'm sure I practiced when I was child.'
(Yukiguni: 37)

b) 小さい時と稽古したのは確かだね。(*)
Chisai toki to keiko shita no wa tashikada ne.
'I'm sure I practiced when I was child.'

This case particle in the sentence serves as a marker of the time of an event. In this sentence the case particle *to* cannot be accepted because it does not show the movement of the two subjects.

- Diathesis on Passive Sentences (受動文の動作主格/Jyudoubun no Dousashukaku)

The passive meaning is the meaning that shows the person or thing that causes an action. Example :

a) どっと真黒な突風に吹き飛ばされた。
Dotto makkurona toppū ni fukitobasareta.
'I was blown away by a black gust.'
(Yukiguni: 78)

b) どっと真黒な突風と吹き飛ばされた。(*)
Dotto makkurona toppū to fukitobasareta.
'It was blown away with a black gust.'

In the sentence above, the passive meaning in terms of the verb form is the past passive form of the verb phrase 吹き飛ばす / fukitobasu (fly) to 吹き飛ばされた / fukitobasareta (flown). In a sentence which means passive, the subject is the goal of an action carried out by the doer (object / person) which is marked by the case particle に / *ni*. In the sentence above, the actor of the verb 吹き飛ばされた / fukitobasareta is 突風 / toppū (strong wind). Therefore, the sentence above cannot be substituted with the case particle *to* because the activity of the verb in the sentence shows a one-sided movement and one of the targets is.

- Diathesis on Causative Sentences (使役文の動作主格 / Shiekibun no Dousashukaku)

The causative meaning is the meaning that shows the target of one's actions. Consider the following example :

- a) 先生は私に返事を考えさせる。
Sensei wa watashi ni henji o kangaesaseru.
'The teacher makes me think to reply.'
(Kokoro: 46)
- b) 先生は私と返事を考えさせる。(*)
Sensei wa watashi to henji o kangaesaseru.
'The teacher makes me think about the reply.'
(Kokoro: 46)

In the sentence above, the causative meaning arises marked by the use of the verb 考えさせる / kangaesaseru (to ask to think), which is the causative form of the verb 考える / kangaeru (think). The verb 考えさせる / kangaesaseru means that the perpetrator is doing something for someone. The actor in this sentence is 先生 / sensei (teacher) which is marked by は / *wa* and someone who becomes the object / target of the action is 私 / watashi (saya) which is marked by the case particle に / *ni*. So in a causative sentence, the case particle に / *ni* acts as the doer of the action. Therefore, the sentence above cannot be substituted with the case particle *to* because the activity of the verb in the sentence shows a one-sided movement and one of the targets is.

- Dative meaning (帰着格 / Kichakukaku)
- a) 真直に村に着くかどうか確かに怪しいよ。
Massugu ni mura ni tsuku ka dō ka tashika ni ayashī yo.
'I'm sure it's doubtful if I'll reach the village straight.'
(Kusa no Hana :105)
- b) 真直に村と着くかどうか確かに怪しいよ。(*)
Massugu ni mura to tsuku ka dō ka tashika ni ayashī yo.
'I'm sure it's doubtful if I'll reach the village straight.'

In sentence (a) there is a particle in this case which functions as a dative, which is an activity that shows an action that moves towards the target object. Sentence (b) is not grammatically acceptable because the relationship between the verb and the noun in the sentence only moves on one target without any movement together.

- Locative meaning (存在場所/Sonzai basho)
 - a) 民家の床にゴロゴロしている。
Minka no yuka ni goro goro shite iru.
'Rumbling on the floor of a private house.'
(Nobi: 2)
 - a) 民家の床とごろごろしている。(*)
Minka no yuka to goro goro shite iru.
'Around the floor of a private house.'

This case particle in a sentence functions as a pointer to the location of an event. In this sentence, the case particle *to* cannot be accepted because it does not show the movement of the two subjects.

Conclusion

This research produces several things that are expected to be useful to readers. *To* and *Ni* as case particles in Japanese in certain contexts can substitute each other but sometimes cannot replace each other. *To* and *Ni* case particles can replace each other for the context of sentences that have the following meanings: Pairs Meaning (相手格/Aitekaku), Translative Meaning (変化格/Henkakaku), Accusative Meaning (対格/taikaku), and Ablative Meaning (奪格/Dakkaku). But on the other hand, *To* and *Ni* as case particles can not substitution each other. Especially sentences that have the following meanings: Accusative Meaning (対格/taikaku), Commitative Meaning (共同格/Kyoudoukaku), Partner Meaning (相手格/Aitekaku), Citation Meaning (引用格/Inyoukaku), Alatif Meaning (方向格/Hōkōkaku), Purpose Meaning (目的格/Mokutekikaku), Time markers Meaning (時間格/Jikankaku), Diathesis on Passive Sentences (受動文の動作主格/Jyudoubun no Dousashukaku), Diathesis on Causative Sentences (使役文の動作主格/Shiekibun no Dousashukaku), Dative Meaning (帰着格/Kichakukaku), and Locative Meaning (存在場所/Sonzai basho). This research can be continued through a pragmatic approach and allows it to be contrasted with other languages.

References

- Austin, M. A., Rodriguez, B. L., McKnight, B., McNeely, M. J., Edwards, K. L., Curb, J. D., & Sharp, D. S. (2000). Low-density lipoprotein particle size, triglycerides, and high-density lipoprotein cholesterol as risk factors for coronary heart disease in older Japanese-American men. *The American journal of cardiology*, 86(4), 412-416. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0002-9149\(00\)00956-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0002-9149(00)00956-5)

- Borris, D. ., & Zecho, C. . (2018). The linguistic politeness having seen on the current study issue. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, 2(1), 32-44. <https://doi.org/10.37028/lingcure.v2n1.10>
- Katagiri, Y. (2007). Dialogue functions of Japanese sentence-final particles 'Yo'and 'Ne'. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 39(7), 1313-1323. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2007.02.013>
- Kita, S., & Ide, S. (2007). Nodding, aizuchi, and final particles in Japanese conversation: How conversation reflects the ideology of communication and social relationships. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 39(7), 1242-1254. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2007.02.009>
- Lee, D. Y. (2002). The function of the zero particle with special reference to spoken Japanese. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 34(6), 645-682. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166\(02\)00042-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166(02)00042-5)
- Lee, D. Y. (2007). Involvement and the Japanese interactive particles ne and yo. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 39(2), 363-388. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2006.06.004>
- Matsuoka, T. & Takubo, Y. (1999). *Kiso Nihongo Bunpou*. Tokyo: Kuroshio Shuppan.
- Ramdani, S., Nimashita, H., & Rahayu, N. (2017). *Kakujoshi Ni dalam Kalimat Bahasa Jepang* (Doctoral dissertation, Riau University).
- Roslina, L. Peran Semantis Partikel Kasus Ni (に), Ga (が), Dan O (を) Sebagai Penanda Objek (Kajian Struktur Dan Makna). *Izumi*, 1(1), 28-35.
- Sudaryanto. (1993). *Metode dan aneka teknik analisis bahasa: pengantar penelitian wahana kebudayaan secara linguistis*. Duta Wacana University Press.
- Sutedi, D. (2016). Analisis Kesalahan Penggunaan Partikel *de*, *ini*, dan *o* pada Kalimat Pembelajar Bahasa Jepang. *Jurnal Japanese Literature*, 2(2), 1-8.
- Sutedi, D. (2020). The Semantic Roles of "kaku-joshi" in Japanese Textbooks. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 5(3), 545-558.
- Tanaka, H. (2000). The particle ne as a turn-management device in Japanese conversation. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 32(8), 1135-1176. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166\(99\)00087-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166(99)00087-9)
- Tsuji, Y. (2000). Activities in discrete particle simulation in Japan. *Powder technology*, 113(3), 278-286. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0032-5910\(00\)00312-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0032-5910(00)00312-0)
- Tsujimura, N. (1997). *An Introduction to Japanese Linguistics*. Massachusetts: Blackwell Publisher.
- Uyeda, R. (1991). Studies of ultrafine particles in Japan: Crystallography. Methods of preparation and technological applications. *Progress in Materials Science*, 35(1), 1-96. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0079-6425\(91\)90004-D](https://doi.org/10.1016/0079-6425(91)90004-D)
- Zhang, D., Iwasaka, Y., Matsuki, A., Ueno, K., & Matsuzaki, T. (2006). Coarse and accumulation mode particles associated with Asian dust in southwestern Japan. *Atmospheric Environment*, 40(7), 1205-1215. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2005.10.037>
- Zhou, M., Okada, K., Qian, F., Wu, P. M., Su, L., Casareto, B. E., & Shimohara, T. (1996). Characteristics of dust-storm particles and their long-range transport from China to Japan—Case studies in April 1993. *Atmospheric research*, 40(1), 19-31. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0169-8095\(95\)00023-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/0169-8095(95)00023-2)